

CORPORATE HEALTH AND SAFETY COMMITTEE

ABERDEEN, Friday, 28 November 2014. Minute of Meeting of the CORPORATE HEALTH AND SAFETY COMMITTEE. Present:- Mike Middleton (GMB), Chairperson; and, Councillor Graham, Vice Chairperson. City Council Representatives:- Councillors Cameron and Finlayson.

Trade Union Representatives:- Karen Davidson (UNISON), Steve Robb (UNITE), Sid Sandison (SSTA) and Carole Thorpe (EIS).

Officers in attendance:- Angela Scott (Chief Executive), Ciaran Monaghan (Head of Service) (Office of Chief Executive), Mary Agnew (Health, Safety and Wellbeing Manager), Colin Leaver (Team Leader), Bruce Findlater (Admin Officer), Carol Fraser (Team Manager), Michael Hearn (Directorate Support Manager), Lesley Kirk (Directorate Support Manager), Carol Slessor (Team Manager), Pete Leonard (Director of Communities, Housing and Infrastructure), Paul Fleming (Head of Customer Service & Performance), Hugh Murdoch (Transportation Manager), Mark Reilly (Head of Public Infrastructure and Environment), John Quinn (Head of Land and Property Assets), Euan Couperwhite (Head of Policy, Performance and Resources), Andrew Jones (Service Manager (Assets / Finance)), Keith Michie (Contract Manager) and Angela Taylor (City Development Executive).

DEPUTATION REQUEST

1. The Chairperson intimated that he had received a verbal request for a deputation from Mr Tommy Campbell, UNITE and Mr Steve Dillon, UCATT in relation to item 4.3 (Cairncry Court Contractor Safety Issue) on the agenda. He advised that the request had been submitted outwith the terms of Standing Order 10(1) and sought the Committee's views on whether to hear the deputation.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to suspend Standing Order 10(1); and
- (ii) to hear the deputation and take the report at item 4.3 as the first item of business.

CAIRNCRY COURT CONTRACTOR SAFETY ISSUE

2. The Committee had before it a report which outlined an incident that had been reported by an employee relating to safety concerns at Cairncry Court whilst building works were being carried out. The report advised that staff from Building Services and the Health, Safety and Wellbeing Team carried out a site inspection and witnessed various safety issues. At the time of the inspection various contractors and building services employees were on site carrying out external cladding and window replacements led by the Principal Contractor, who was managed by Housing and Environment and replacement heating works being carried out by gas contractors, who were being managed by Enterprise, Planning and Infrastructure. It was noted that the

works were meant to be carried out at different stages however due to other issues all contractors were on site at the same time.

The report further advised that the safety failings raised were similar to those that the Principal Contractor had been sanctioned for previously and that there was little evidence to suggest that the issues had been rectified. A further health and safety action noticed was issued with a deadline for the next day. A further site visit was undertaken and improvements were in place. Site visits were undertaken to the other multi storeys part of the project where an additional safety issue was identified.

The report contained detailed information relating to the safety issues and made the following recommendations for improvement:

- (a) Improve management of contractors by (i) establishing a process to escalate and address safety concerns of ACC site and senior management; and (ii) to agree timescales for remedial action with contractors and check they are completed;
- (b) ACC should discuss with the Principal Contractor how they plan to improve control of site prior to the commencement of work and ongoing by (i) considering how the Principal Contractor will increase monitoring of site; and (ii) the Principal Contractor improving management of their contractors on site to prohibit unsafe working at height;
- (c) Improve control of contractors by ACC by (i) including site inspections as part of the ACC/Principal Contractor weekly meetings; and (ii) to include safety performance as part of weekly meetings;
- (d) Implement process to control Principal Contractors, other Contractors and ACC Building Services working on site; and
- (e) The above learning points require to be implemented across the organisation.

The Committee had circulated a paper prepared by the Service which presented a response to each of the recommendations.

The Committee heard from Mr Campbell and Mr Dillon who provided information relating to various health and safety issues on the Cairncry site which they had been notified of. They sought clarification from officers relating to when they became aware of the issues and requested that they receive copies of the incident logs and minutes of any meetings to assure them that processes had been put in place to address the issues.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note the content of the report;
- (ii) to note that the Service had progressed the issue and measures were in place to prevent the issues happening again; and
- (iii) to instruct the Service to issue Mr Campbell and Mr Dillon with details of the meetings and incident logs as requested.

HYDROGEN BUS PROJECT - REPORT BY THE DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND INFRASTRUCTURE

3. With reference to article 7 of the minute of its meeting of 29 August 2014, the Committee had before it (1) a presentation from Mr Mills from BOC and the City Development Project Manager which provided the Committee with an understanding of the technical aspects of how the hydrogen depot worked; (2) a report by the Director

of Communities, Housing and Infrastructure which provided an update on the health and safety matters at the Kittybrewster depot in relation to the Hydrogen Bus Project; and (3) copies of the weekly bulletin issued in relation to the project.

The Committee asked various questions in relation to the technical aspects of the project mainly focused around the safety of the site and the mechanisms in place to shut down the system in the event of a fault.

The report advised that as part of the project, the Council were supporting two strategic European hydrogen transport projects, the first major element related to the introduction of ten hydrogen buses to the North-east of Scotland which would be fuelled using locally generated hydrogen and the second major element would be the creation of a hydrogen production facility to generate the hydrogen, both of which would be delivered in two phases over a four year period.

The report stated that following concerns raised by staff and trade union officials relating to the location of the temporary hydrogen supply and the lack of information being issued in relation to the hydrogen project activities, that the hydrogen supply had been relocated to a secure site and that a briefing session had been held for senior officials and trade union officials and that weekly bulletins were now being issued to senior officials and trade union officials for them to distribute to staff.

The report further advised that a Fleet Health and Safety Compliance Officer had been appointed and discussions were on-going to define the permanent role. The postholder would be liaising with the health and safety team to ensure the health and safety on site was being monitored and addressed.

The weekly bulletin issued to staff provides information on the project and outlines the key activities for the next few weeks.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to thank Mr Mills and Mr Win for their presentation; and
- (ii) to otherwise note the content of the report.

**REPORTING ARRANGEMENTS WITH AUDIT, RISK AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE -
REPORT BY THE ACTING DIRECTOR OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE**

4. The Clerk advised that this item had been withdrawn from the agenda at the request of the Interim Director for Corporate Governance. The Audit, Risk and Scrutiny Committee discussed the report at their meeting on 20 November 2014 and as part of the discussions, the issue of whether the constitution should include reference to Regional Trade Union representatives attending this committee. The Audit, Risk and Scrutiny Committee agreed to refer the matter to the next meeting of the Local Government Employees Joint Consultative Committee for a decision to be taken.

The Chairperson requested members of this Committee to provide any comments or amendments on the amended constitution to the Clerk for inclusion prior to it being approved by this Committee and the Audit, Risk and Scrutiny Committee in the next cycle of meetings.

The Committee resolved:-

to note the information provided.

APOLOGIES

5. Apologies for absence were intimated on behalf of Councillor Donnelly, Ewan Sutherland, Joe Craig, George Ferguson, John Noble, David Willis and Kate Mackay.

MINUTE OF PREVIOUS MEETING OF 29 AUGUST 2014

6. The Committee had before it the minute of its previous meeting of 29 August 2014.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the minute subject to the amendment at article 3, on page 2 to change the percentage for provision of appointments to 95%.

MATTERS ARISING

7. In relation to item 4 (Social Care and Wellbeing Report), resolution (i), Councillor Graham advised that he had not received a copy of the investigation report or the associated action plan associated with Marchburn Children's Home and requested that this be issued, whereupon the Team Manager advised that meetings had taken place with Councillors and Trade Unions on the matter and would ensure that the action plan was issued.

In relation to item 6 (Marischal College Incident), the Chairperson requested an update in relation to the incident, whereupon the Head of Service for Office of Chief Executive advised that he had been asked to provide an update to the Committee in relation to the incident and the progress of implementing the recommendations.

Councillor Graham sought clarification as to whether staff at other customer access points had received the same training and advice, whereupon the Head of Service advised that he would ensure all staff received the training.

Councillor Finlayson suggested that a queuing system or similar be introduced at the area where customers make first contact with an adviser as at times the person using the tablet was in demand.

The Chairperson requested that a full written report be submitted to the next meeting to highlight all improvements undertaken and to provide assurance to the Committee that all recommendations had been implemented.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) in relation to Marchburn Children's Home, to note that the Service would ensure Councillor Graham received a copy of the report and action plan;
- (ii) in relation to the Marischal College incident, to instruct the Service to submit a detailed report to the next meeting of the Committee; and
- (iii) to otherwise note the information provided.

COMMITTEE BUSINESS STATEMENT

8. With reference to article 3 of the minute of its meeting of 29 August 2014, the Committee had before it a statement of outstanding business prepared by the Clerk.

In relation to item 1 (School Security), the Service Manager advised that an extensive analysis of the survey results would be undertaken and shared with the School Security Review Group to ensure that the work priorities identified were correct and that following that meeting a comprehensive report would be submitted to this Committee. He further advised that he was working with colleagues to ensure that risk assessment training was in place for all head teachers.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note the update in relation to School Security and that a comprehensive report would be submitted to the next meeting of this Committee; and
- (ii) subject to the decision at article 10, to remove item 2 (Fire at Kittybrewster).

APPOINTMENT OF CHAIRPERSON AND VICE CHAIRPERSON

9. The outgoing Chairperson advised that in terms of the constitution, the Committee were to appoint a Chairperson from within the Councillor membership and a Vice Chairperson from within the Trade Union representatives and called for nominations for the position of Chairperson. Councillor Cameron, seconded by Councillor Finlayson nominated Councillor Graham. There were no further nominations therefore Councillor Graham was appointed as Chairperson and took the Chair.

Councillor Graham thanked members for the opportunity and then called for nominations for the position of Vice Chairperson. Sid Sandison (SSTA), seconded by Carole Thorpe (EIS) nominated Mike Middleton (GMB). There were no further nominations therefore Mike Middleton was appointed as Vice Chairperson.

Mike Middleton thanked members for the appointment.

The Committee resolved:-

to appoint Councillor Graham as Chairperson and Mike Middleton as Vice Chairperson.

VEHICLE FIRE AT FLEET SERVICES, KITTYBREWSTER - REPORT BY THE DIRECTOR OF COMMUNITIES, HOUSING AND INFRASTRUCTURE

10. With reference to article 5 of the minute of its meeting of 29 August 2014, the Committee had before it a report by the Director of Communities, Housing and Infrastructure which provided an update on the actions agreed previously.

The report advised that the roads and fleet blacksmiths were to merge and be located at West Tullos so information was gathered from the blacksmiths which identified that a number of operating practices required to be risk assessed prior to the merger. As part of the new structure within Communities, Housing and Infrastructure, the new Head of Service initiated a wider review and update of working practices within Fleet which would be implemented in early 2015.

In response to a question from the Chairperson relating to whether all of the previous recommendations had been implemented, the Head of Public Infrastructure and Environment advised that as part of the ongoing review all of the recommendations would be considered and actions taken to address each of them.

The Chairperson requested that an interim report be submitted to the next meeting to provide an update in relation to the health and safety procedures within Fleet Operations.

The report recommended:

that the Committee note the progress on implementing the actions and instruct the Head of Public Infrastructure and Environment to report back to this Committee in two cycles time with an update of steps taken to address areas for improving management of risks and safety within Fleet Operations.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to note the progress on implementing the actions; and
- (ii) to instruct the Head of Public Infrastructure and Environment to submit an interim report to the next meeting of this Committee providing an update in relation to health and safety procedures within Fleet Operations.

CORPORATE GOVERNANCE HEALTH AND SAFETY REPORT - REPORT BY THE ACTING DIRECTOR OF CORPORATE GOVERNANCE

11. The Committee had before it the annual health and safety report for the Corporate Governance Service for the period 1 October 2013 to 30 September 2014 which included a Director's statement and the Service Health and Safety Action Plan.

The report advised that (1) there were 700 members of staff across the directorate; (2) the Service held regular health and safety meetings which were attended by trade union officials and management; and (3) the service offered flu vaccinations to groups of staff who had been identified by managers as requiring one as part of a business continuity risk assessment, whereby 25 employees received the vaccination.

The report contained the following statistical information:-

- there were 13 accidents, none of which were reportable
- there were 22 incidents reported which was an increase from the previous year and 20 of those were attributable to mainly verbal abuse to staff within the Customer Service and Performance team
- the scores relating to the individual elements of the health and safety matrix were: 100% for Accident and Incident Reporting and Workplace Inspections; 96% for First Aid and Risk Assessment
- 190 employees attended health and safety training
- the number of days lost per employee per month due to absence ranged from 9.8 days in May 2014 (highest) to 8.7 days in September 2014 (lowest)
- the overall score for compliance was 98%
- the short term number of days absent was approximately 3.5 days per employee
- the long term number of days absent was approximately 5 per employee

The Committee resolved:-

to note the content of the report.

EDUCATION, CULTURE AND SPORT HEALTH AND SAFETY REPORT - REPORT BY THE DIRECTOR OF EDUCATION, CULTURE AND SPORT

12. The Committee had before it the annual health and safety report for the Education, Culture and Sport Service for the period 1 October 2013 to 30 September 2014 which included the Service Health and Safety Action Plan.

The report contained the following statistical information:-

- there were 39 accidents to employees, of which 4 were reportable
- there were 188 accidents to third parties, of which 8 were reportable
- the employee accident frequency rate was 0.09 per 1000 employees
- there were 93 incidents with the majority of them being reported by Schools and Educational Establishments
- there were 446 reported incidents of violence against school staff, 177 were against teaching staff and 294 against support staff
- the total number of days lost due to absence was 9659 for teaching staff and 14396 for all other staff
- the average number of days lost due to absence per employee was 8
- 580 employees received the flu vaccination
- 764 employees attended health and safety training
- the service has been developing specific guidelines on responding to high risk behaviour and the use of de-escalation and physical restraint in schools and educational establishments
- the scores for the individual elements of the health and safety matrix for Communities, Culture and Sport were: 100% for Emergency Precautions in Place, Housekeeping and Cleaning, First Aid, Slips, trips and hazards, Machinery Plant and Equipment, Welfare and Accidents an Incidents Reporting, 95% for Environment and 75% for Risk Assessment
- the scores for the individual elements of the health and safety matrix for Schools and Educational Establishments were: 100% for Machinery Plant and Equipment, Welfare and Accidents an Incidents Reporting, 99% for Housekeeping and Cleaning, Environment, and First Aid, 96 % for Emergency Precautions in Place, 94% for Slips, trips and hazards and 91% for Risk Assessment
- 210 out of 234 workplace inspections had been completed

The report advised that a detailed survey of the current security arrangements within schools had been carried out in order to identify the schools most in need of improvements which would be prioritised over a three year period. Most primary schools across the estate had been fitted with locally controlled access systems which were located in the school admin office to ensure that any alarms could be dealt with throughout the school day. The current software of the system was due to be updated where necessary in early 2015.

Sid Sandison stated that he was aware that not all incidents were being reported properly as teachers were not being reminded to complete both forms. The Service responded by stating that all incidents had to be reported via YourHR and that they

were working with colleagues to get all information reported via one system. The Committee noted that there was still an issue with accessing the Zone and YourHr within schools.

The Health, Safety and Wellbeing Manager advised that the process was that all accidents and incidents were reported via Your Hr and that this needed to be promoted throughout the organisation via Senior Management. To enable all staff to have access to the system the ICT issues with accessing Your Hr needed to be addressed or at least that managers within schools had access to enable them to record all incidents using the corporate mechanism.

Sid Sandison also requested that Health Checks be offered to teachers outwith the school academic year to allow teachers to attend without having to get cover. The Health, Safety and Wellbeing Manager advised that she had a set period of time in which to use the appointments and that she would take this on board for future years.

The Committee resolved:-

- (i) to request that access to the Zone and Your Hr be resolved to ensure all incidents and accidents were recorded appropriately; and
- (ii) to otherwise note the content of the report.

HEALTH AND SAFETY IMPROVEMENT PLAN - PAPER BY HEALTH, SAFETY AND WELLBEING MANAGER

13. The Committee had before it the Corporate Health and Safety Improvement Plan for 2014 – 2016 prepared by the Health, Safety and Wellbeing Manager which outlined each of the improvement themes and associated tasks, measurements and responsible person for each of the improvements.

The Committee were asked to approve the improvement plan to enable officers to progress the improvement actions. At this stage in the meeting the Committee were not quorate, therefore those present agreed the improvement plan with the decision to be ratified at the next Committee meeting.

The Committee resolved:-

to approve the content of the improvement plan and ratify the decision at the next meeting.

At this point in the meeting, the Committee were not quorate therefore all items from this point onwards were deferred until the next meeting.

DATE OF NEXT MEETING

14. The Committee noted that their next meeting was scheduled for 20 February 2015.

- GORDON GRAHAM, Chairperson